The Stigma of "Underdevelopment" in Heritage Production

Workshop | 11 October 2019

Berlage Zaal 2
Faculty of Architecture and the Built Environment | TU Delft

Program

9.30-10.00   Coffee
Welcome note by John Hanna (Sit-Im) and
Jasmijn Rana

10.00 -11.30   Round Table (1): Designating Who is Who in
developmental Narratives

Maissan Hassan
Remembering the Egyptian Surrealists: Contested Narratives on
Art and Liberty

Daniela Salgado Cofré
Living through making: Between development and selective
tradition (in Chile)

Maurits Ertsen
Convincing fantasy cannot become dated: From colonial irrigation
narratives of progress to political claims of irrigation heritage

Respondent
Jasmijn Rana (Leiden University)

11.30- 11.45
Coffee Break

11.45- 13.15   Roundtable (2): Sites of Underdevelopment

Jonathan Bill Doe
Metaphorical Eulogies of West African Underdevelopment (Ghana)

John Hanna
Modernity disrupted: Lebanese Architectural Heritage and the Construction of National Identity

Mela Zuljevic
The stigma of "in-betweeness" in the transitional landscape of Mostar (Bosnia and Herzegovina)

María Novas and Dorina Pllumbi
The architectural Stigma of Ugliness: The cases of Galicia and Albania

Respondent
Zoltan Dujisin (Erasmus University Rotterdam)

13.15 - 14.15
Lunch Break

14.15 - 15.45 Round Table (3): Heritagization and narratives of Underdevelopment

Marcia Hattori
The political transition and the uses of post conflict heritage in a neoliberal city: some reflections about the supermodernity and transmodernity

Siyun Wu
The Heritage Wheel: An "underdeveloped" island turning into utopia (Estonia)

Ian R. Simpson
Abjection by heritage and development failures (Jarash, Jordan)

Joseph Heathcott
Barrios Magicos: Trading on Underdevelopment for Heritage Tourism in Mexico City

Respondent
Carolyn Birdsall (University of Amsterdam)

15.45 - 17.15 Roundtable (4): Subjectivities of/ around Underdevelopment: Questions on Time and Temporality

Iskandar Ahmad Abdalla
"Time for change is today!" : Reforming Islam and narratives of temporality. Contemporary Germany as a case study.

Dana Dolghin
Histories of underdevelopment, configurations of prevention (in Eastern Europe)

Nermin Elsherif
"Time Passes, But the Future doesn't Come": The expectations and frustrations of Modernity and the imaginaries of Heritage in Egypt

Boana Visser
The Imagined Realities of "The Underdeveloped": Uses of Underdevelopment Discourse among Indigenous People in Panama

Respondent
Leila Musson (KNAW) (tbc)

**17.15 - 18.15   Closing session: Sit-Imers and respondents
               Theorizing for underdevelopment**

**18.30 -
Dinner**

The workshop is the inaugural project of Sit-Im. (Situated Imaginaries, www.sit-im.org), a network of scholars and practitioners acknowledging the urgency of active imagination in transforming current socio-political realities. It is concerned by the way knowledge is currently being produced, validated and disseminated. The network brings together a group of geographers, anthropologists, media and culture scholars, historians, archaeologists, architects and spatial practitioners examining problems and prospects from the Global South, not as a location but defined by social, economic and political conditions.

The "underdeveloped" is a label often ascribed by the powerful to those who possess less power, by those who perceive themselves as developed to an "Other". The concepts of "development", "progress" and "advancement" were at the centre of the contested Western imperial project of modernity. These concepts were later embraced by post-colonial nations of the global south after World War II and further on by states in Eastern Europe during and at the end of the Cold War as a standard to achieve. Thus, the legacies of the modernist colonial projects outlived the formal colonialism and became integrated in succeeding social orders, resulting in what Mignolo (2007), Grosfoguel & Georas (2010) and Ndlovu-Gatsheni (2013) refer to as "coloniality of power". The language of development spoke of a better future, a good life often symbolized by selective notions of capitalism, human rights, liberal democracy - the characteristics of which varied in different parts of the world. Central to these conceptions of development is a particular understanding of modernity as inevitable and inescapable, a telos, and a logical consequence of the progress of time (Ferguson, 2005) which nevertheless reiterated a distinction between the developed and underdeveloped.

The "underdeveloped" is also a subject position created by this discourse of modernity. It is a subjectivity that can be embraced and negotiated, a stigma that often haunts particular subjects, cultures, and usually passed on from one generation to another. The label of "underdevelopment" left different nations - outside the West - with different frames of negative pasts. Although Ferguson (2005) and Berlant (2011) argued these developmental narratives have lost their credibility in different parts of the world, nevertheless, individuals seem stuck with the label of "underdevelopment", awaiting a modernity that is continuously interrupted or postponed by economic crisis, wars, authoritarianism, natural disasters, etc. It became a type of heritage, in the definition offered by Graburn (2001) who defines heritage as the cultural transmission of a material or a symbolic estate (a set of myth, rights, ownerships, stories or persona). By considering it a large part of what constitutes the identity of an individual or a collective, he urges us to expand

our understanding of heritage beyond what is labelled as "world heritage" by nation states and institutions like UNESCO.

Instead, his definition of heritage rhymes with others by Appadurai (1998), Chatterjee (1993), Asad (2003), Mitchel (2005), Blacker and Etkind (2013) urging us to investigate the past - and accordingly heritage - as a resource for identity formation, and a site of contestation of dissonant narratives. While the "underdeveloped" is often discussed within heritage and memory studies as problem that requires a progressive intervention, a crisis or a danger that needs remedy, we invite scholars from interdisciplinary backgrounds and different area studies to further investigate how the stigma of underdevelopment works in heritage production.

• How is the stigma of "underdevelopment" employed and negotiated in the production of heritage?
• How does one choose to represent the present or the future, knowing that this heritage comes from an uncontested ideal of progress or the disruption of it?
• How do sites of memory emphasize or conceal representations of "underdevelopment"?
• What are the subjectivities produced by the discourse of "underdevelopment"? To what extent do they internalize these narratives of the self/collective?
• How is a particular frame of the past labelled as "underdeveloped"?

Book of Abstracts

Remembering the Egyptian Surrealists: Contested Narratives on Art and Liberty

Maissan Hassan
Museums and Collections, Leiden University

In response to the opening of the exhibition Art et Liberté: Rupture, War and Surrealism in Egypt (1938–1948) in Tate Liverpool in 2017, art critic Jonathan Jones of The Guardian asked "Why should we look at second-rate imitations of a modern French style when we could be contemplating a majestically beautiful minbar carved in Cairo in the 15th century?" While Jones's appreciation of Cairo's Islamic architecture could be well-founded, it is intriguing that the paintings by the Egyptian surrealists did not bring about a similar reaction by Jones. Describing the works of the Cairo-based Art and Liberty group as derivative copies of a modernist style could be understood as a reflection of a position that labels the Egyptian surrealists' artistic practices as 'underdeveloped' in comparison to the practices of the Europebased modern artists in the 1930s and 1940s. Interestingly, positioning the legacy of Art and Liberty in relation to Europe-based modernist groups has triggered scholarly debates. Several voices in these debates such as art historian and curator Salah Hassan and film studies scholar Michael Richardson evoke post-colonial paradigms in their discussions of Art and Liberty. On the other hand, the Art et Liberté exhibition clearly takes an opposing stance to a post-colonial analysis of the group. Sam Bardaouil, art historian and co-curator of the Art et Liberté exhibition, argues that the group's legacy is best understood in light of anti-nationalist interculturalism. The paper explores the extent to which the stigma of the 'underdeveloped' is manifested in the recent production of knowledge on the memory of the Art and Liberty group. By studying the landscape of relevant curatorial projects on Art and Liberty, the paper examines the extent to which the notion of inter-cultural exchange could be instrumental in contesting a narrative that portrays Art and Liberty's artistic practices as an example of an 'underdeveloped' form of modern art.

Living through making: Between development and selective tradition

Daniela Salgado Cofre
Phd. Candidate, Industrial Designer- PUCV, Chile | Faculté d'Architecture-
Université Libre de Bruxelles, Belgium Sasha Lab - Social Sciences and
Architecture
daniela.salgado.cofre@ulb.ac.be

There is a growing tension between innovation and tradition in contemporary
societies, especially in those inbetween low industrialized production and a
fast-growing consumption. In Chile, the political context and the free market
economy have had a great incidence on the territorial evolution of the rural
areas, their progress and productivity, generating a fast transformation in the
use of the resources and activities. Due to this dynamic transformation, there
is a suspected idea of crisis affecting traditional artisanal clusters in rural
environments, reinforced by a mercantilist perspective that situates crafts as
a relevant factor for economic and cultural growth. This vision presented by
the UNESCO supports traditional artisanal communities as a component for
human development. Nevertheless, this heritage is not static and is influenced
by several global trends, that have been used by the artisans to re-shape the
technical and social aspects surrounding their rural spaces of production and
activities. Thus, this contribution studies the discourses of cultural heritage
embodied in the making of crafts or artesanías in Chile, and explore how
diverse institutions and actors have established patterns for innovation or
tradition – or selective tradition– generating exclusion, political propaganda
and gender subjection.   This work takes the controversial case study of
Pomaire –a village with more than 230 families related to craft making– to
trace, deploy and compare the main discourses expressed during the last 50
years by various actors linked with the artisanal production. Thus, it presents
a way to explore the controversies and resistance between the reality against
the ideals of tradition and development in the craft's world.

Convincing fantasy cannot become dated. From colonial irrigation narratives of progress to political claims of irrigation heritage

Maurits W. Ertsen
Water Resources Management | Delft University of Technology
m.w.ertsen@tudelft.nl

In the 19th and 20th century, European colonial powers developed huge irrigation efforts, under the umbrella of colonial development – both economic and societal, as irrigation would yield useful financial resources, but also allow the indigenous population to grow into useful citizens. The colonial irrigation project(s) did clearly not appreciate what that same population and their rulers had already been able to produce in terms of irrigation infrastructure or management. This dismissal came in two shapes: either the precolonial efforts were great for their time, but no longer great, or the indigenous arrangements were simply insufficient for modern development. The colonial irrigation mission(s) typically mobilized the idea that the European powers were the successor of ancient empires and benevolent modern rulers at the same time. In the post-colonial world of irrigation, typically the colonial project(s) were continued by the independent nations. These new nations and the former colonial powers met in the international world of irrigation development, for example in the governmental network the International Commission on Irrigation and Drainage (ICID). Where ICID has been an engineering-based network for a long time, in more recent years it has become more sensitive for other societal issues, including heritage, through its task force on World Heritage Irrigation Structures (WHIS). On the list of proposed heritage projects we encounter some colonial efforts, but precolonial sites and systems dominate. I am fascinated by the apparent shift in the irrigation narrative. From useless dated matter, or useless indigenous ideas, what had been discarded to develop colonial modernization projects that laid the base of most of the current irrigation systems worldwide – and not just in the former colonial areas – the precolonial systems and sites have regained their value. The twist, however, seems to be that becoming heritage does not mean that the ideas are necessarily valued in themselves as equivalent to modern counterparts. This is an issue I would like to discuss further, as one of the criteria for the WHIS list is whether heritage systems and sites are still functional (List A) or not anymore (List B).

Metaphorical Eulogies of West African Underdevelopment

Jonathan Bill Doe
Brandenburg University of Technology | Cottbus, Germany

It has been about seventy years since the concept of development and underdevelopment was introduced into the socio-economic discourse. The presentation of the concept spurred on aspirations among local groups in West Africa. Underdevelopment was introduced as a concept that defined them for which they had to reject for development. On the other hand, development came to mean westernisation, a process that was rooted in colonisation and postcoloniality of West African societies. The UNESCO's admission of communities as key stakeholders in heritage management empowers the views of multiple stakeholders tied to the Slave dungeons/Castles in Ghana. The stakeholders of UNESCO's Slave dungeons/Castles in Ghana constitute the state agency responsible for managing the building, local community, European nations that built them and African Americans. Metaphorically, the image of a castle has come to represent development to Ghanaian communities and European communities. The dungeon represents underdevelopment. On the contrary, the African American community contest that the dungeon represents the authentic history of the buildings. Drawing on Tversky and Kahneman's heuristic principles of representativeness, availability of instances and adjustment from anchor, it shall be argued that though the metaphorical dungeon image represents underdevelopment, it is necessary for the protection of UNESCO's Outstanding Universal Value philosophy (OUV). The argument raises two questions, how the ambivalence memory of underdevelopment can be concealed or otherwise without belittling the other community. Also, in what respects the communities are using the OUV canonical philosophy to advance their interests? In answering the foregoing questions, heuristic evidence shall be derived from West African and Diaspora historical records and through personal experiences derived from leading tours to the Slave dungeons/Castles in Ghana.

Modernity disrupted: Lebanese Architectural Heritage and the Construction of National Identity

John Hanna
PhD Candidate, TU Delft
j.m.k.k.hanna@tudelft.nl

In the years following the independence of Lebanon in 1943, Beirut witnessed an urban and architectural boom. Benefitting from an apposite political and economic ambiance, the Lebanese government pursued its nation-building project through urban development, among other activities. This has been often promoted by state agencies as a linear path towards modernity, through which Lebanon can stand out as a modern and a progressive state in the region. In architecture, this has mainly occurred through contributing to an international post world war 2 architectural discourse. Prominent local and international architects worked on responding to the state vision. International-style high-rise buildings and commercial complexes designed by renowned architects such as Alvar Aalto, Alfred Roth, Victor Green and Oscar Niemeyer were constructed in Beirut and other major cities. However, the outbreak of the civil violence in 1975 marked a breach and an interruption of the Lebanese route towards development–as seen by its political elite, leaving behind a nation in a constant state of lamentation of a lost modernity. The architectural heritage of the pre-civil war decades stands today as both a symbol of a once sought modernity and a reminder of a short-lived national project. This paper examines the notions of development, and the disruption thereof in relation to the Lebanese nation-building project. It particularly investigates the situation of a national identity along the lines of a west-inspired development rhetoric. Furthermore, the paper questions the dynamics of the present 'moment' in the context of the urban and architectural heritage and their contribution to the continuous renegotiation of a national collective identity.

The stigma of "in-betweeness" in the transitional landscape of Mostar

Mela Zuljevic
PhD student | Faculty of Architecture & Arts, University of Hasselt
zuljevicmela@gmail.com

The city of Mostar has been described through history as the place where civilizations meet - its famous Old Bridge, after the international project of post-war reconstruction, became a commonplace among representations of multiculturality, the 'in-between' of the East and the West. In this paper, I explore the notion of a 'transitional landscape' starting from an understanding of landscape as a technology of a territory, where the process of transitioning from one value system to another is the dominant aspect of this technology. I intend to examine how such a transitional landscape is produced in Mostar, by looking at two sites through which the city was constructed, as the two anchors of development after destructive and violent ruptures in historical time. After the Second World War, the SOKO aircraft factory became the epitome of socialist development, while the Old Town of Mostar was reconstructed after the 90s war in Bosnia and Herzegovina, to become a UNESCO world heritage site and the economic centre of the city. The narratives of progress and development of former Yugoslavia's ideals of socialism and self-management, embodied in the SOKO factory, are being replaced by new ones, of international peace and neoliberal economy, exemplified at the site of the Old Town. In an attempt to outline the transitional landscape, I will focus on how these contesting narratives were materialized through spatial transformation, along with the position of 'inbetweeness', as a haunting historical experience of being forever stuck between failure of underdevelopment and a progressive future. How is the notion of 'in-betweeness' interiorised in practical ways and for practical reasons, and historicized through spatial practice by those constructing their livelihoods around these sites? How are the contesting imaginaries of progress captured or concealed in the translation of cultural and socio-political values to specific designs and heritage products? To address these questions, I will examine development documents and visions designed by local and international elites and analyse how these narratives are historicized, interpreted or concealed in the landscape through spatial practices, designs and developments performed by different actors in the two sites.

The architectural stigma of ugliness. The cases of Galicia and Albania

María Novas & Dorina Pllumbi
PhD Candidate, Universidad de Sevilla & Guest Researcher, Delft University of Technology
mnovas.f@gmail.com

The idea of this paper started from the authors coming together and finding striking territorial and social similarities in their places of origin. Despite their many differences at first sight, both territories have: a similar surface area (around 28.000 km2) and population (roughly 2.800.000 million people), a meaningless geopolitical influence and isolation due to their rugged geography, and peripheral position in Europe (southwest/southeast), and due to the recent past history of dictatorship. Lastly, what this paper is trying to point out is that although they have a diverse and unique landscape of mountains, sand and sea, both territories share the phenomenon of a stigmatized built scene, as a compendium of architectural ugliness, the rootlessness constructions of a way of living under the myth of the underdevelopment. Galicia (still) receives ERDF funds since the incorporation of Spain in 1986 to the UE "to strengthen economic and social cohesion in the European Union by correcting imbalances between its regions". Albania, as part of the Balkan region, is one of the candidate countries "working hard" politically and economically to show progress in order to be accepted as an EU member. Often times countries like Netherlands have shown reluctancy to start the negotiation process for Albania to be a member of EU. Both territories have gone through a transitional period where change of regimes have been reflected in the materiality of an architecture of laiser-fair, where the role of the state has been absent for a certain period of time, leading to laiser-fair building practices. Galicia suffered the full effects of the lax control of fast urbanization from modern capitalist state; from the "developmentalism" from the fifties under dictator Franco regime, to a completely established consumer mass society in the transition to democracy in the seventies. Albania, in the '90s, transitioned from a centrally controlled socialist totalitarian regime to a fragile democracy which now is consolidating into a neoliberal regime. Galicia was an agricultural world that abruptly shifted to asphalt policies of infrastructures and roads, of local developers and building industrialized materials. Similarly, in Albania with the market economy, construction companies popped up and started to change the economic character of the country. Also, small scale building initiatives occupied the territory in a frenetic way. That was how reinforced concrete, aluminium or PVC frames and fibre-cement sheeting of architectural anarchy started, little by little, to colonize

urban shapes and rural landscapes. "Feísmo" (ugliness) is the Galician voice established by people, media and now even government to identify this phenomenon. A non-fortuitous word that perfectly describes the subjectivities behind this negative discourse of the architectural past, which is also present and future. The adjective ugliness stigmatises the architectural productions of the people who many times build themselves their own houses, sheds or closures, in most cases recycling or reusing materials. Ethic and aesthetic of an inherent cultural practice that could travel from the disrespect for popular culture, to a positive appropriation of a defiant practice (Ergoesfera, 2018). A present site of contestation of dissonant narratives of ugliness, also from the past, in the way to a different future.

The political transition and the uses of post conflict heritage in a neoliberal city: some reflections about the supermodernity and transmodernity

Márcia Lika Hattori
PhD Candidate, Basque Country University | Consejo Superior de Investigaciones Científicas - CSIC
marcia.hattori@incipit.csic.es

The term negative heritage, widely used when referring to contexts related to places and spaces that are related to a traumatic memory, is often linked to dictatorships, wars, genocides and always linked to an idea of the future: "nunca más" or never again. Studies on the subject have increased considerably in recent years between congresses, publications, training courses related to areas such as human rights, forensic anthropology, humanitarian aid, among others. Nonetheless, the ultra-conservative turn that is added to discourses of intolerance and the denial of torture, murder and disappearance, added to the re-reading of authoritarian periods as it has been happening throughout Latin America, especially in Brazil, makes us question the processes of political transition and the scope of these works and the processes of patrimonialization of the so-called negative heritage. In countries of the so-called global south, which heritage is not linked to genocide and colonialism? This paper aims to identify the uses of heritage related to dictatorship in neoliberal contexts and its use, understanding heritage as one of the mechanisms used in modernity by the state, even those related to resistance.

The Heritage Wheel: An "underdeveloped" island turning into utopia

Siyun Wu

PhD. student | Institute of Cultural Anthropology and Development Sociology, Leiden University. Visiting PhD. | Department of Ethnology, University of Tartu
siyun2016@gmail.com

On the small Kihnu island, a UNESCO listed World Heritage in Estonia, a travel wheel illustrating a typical route to introduce the island to visitors is designed by the locals as a symbol of Kihnu. The wheel represents many elements of local heritage: traditional red strip dress, music and dancing circle, transportation – ship, bike and motorcycle. It also demonstrates their communal lifestyle and characteristics as Kihnu people. Here, people are getting to keep their old-fashion life proudly and their traditional lifestyle is increasingly seen as fashionable and an ideal. Approaching the island ethnographically, I look into the local process of heritage-making as a social practice under complex power relationships as well as an inseparable part of people's everyday life in all possible aspects. Inspired by the Kihnu wheel and the local context of heritagization, I want to suggest one possibility of understanding heritage as a turning wheel, a process of production that can redefine, negotiate, and even overturn the meanings of 'the old', 'the traditional', 'the underdeveloped', which are often deemed as the opposite of civilization, modernity and progressive society. In this paper, I investigate critically on how the Kihnu wheel is turning, by whom, and why. How does the "underdeveloped" island keeping old traditions and traditional lifestyle "as the past" become a representative example of Estonian/World heritage, a utopia with a better life? How is the turning of underdeveloped into utopia produced not without poetic imagination in connections with other sociocultural processes? And how does it happen under the joint (re)construction from the local (self) and various others from elsewhere in Estonia and around the world? The changing perception of underdevelopment opens space to reflex the current diagram of development and modernity, which often bases on urbanization and industrialization. This alternative imagination of the underdeveloped as a better future can perhaps further lead us to rethink the relationship between the so-called more civilized, more powerful Global North and the less so Global South. With the heritage wheel turning, can different power positions and hierarchies of value swift and be negotiated?

Abjection by heritage and development failures

Ian R. Simpson
Assistant Professor | Faculty of Archaeology | Leiden University
i.r.simpson@arch.leidenuniv.nl

This contribution considers the stigma of underdevelopment in cultural
heritage projects by discussing the failure of development policies
and interventions and how such failure can reinforce the conditions of
'underdevelopment' that heritage interventions were meant to alleviate in the
first place. There is a sense of a self-fulfilling prophecy of stigmatisation due
to 'development' failing as a project. This 'underdevelopment' by failure is well
exemplified at the town of Jarash in northern Jordan. I consider the making
of political subjects in the abjection precipitated by the unmet promises and
failed efforts of heritage and development, and the way some local groups
express abjection more than others. There is a sense in which people feel
that the practices and opportunities concerning cultural heritage at Jarash
amplify an already abject state in a place that is often framed and devalued
by residents and non-residents as rural and lacking opportunity. Despite
claiming to address the benefits of conserving the historic fabric of the town,
international development projects targeting Jarash engage with local culture
and knowledge in narrow, very circumscribed ways (or overlooking culture
altogether) in their evaluations of people and place and in their conception and
measures of 'development'. The abject 'failure' of Jordan's multiple nominations
for World Heritage status for Jarash and the associated humiliation or stigma
has to be seen within the framing of an 'underdeveloped' rural governate of
Jarash in a global hegemonic ordering of places. This paper will also take up
the question of to what extent scholarly acceptance and collusion in heritage
as a concept allows development knowledge and thinking to dominate
representation of the present and future and remain impervious to radically
different knowledge and ways of thinking that anthropology can foster
and produce. There is a need to critically question the epistemic terrain of
anthropology and critical heritage studies in their relations with the regime of
development knowledge.

Barrios Magicos:
Trading on Underdevelopment for Heritage Tourism in Mexico City

Joseph Heathcott
The New School, New York

In 2011, the planning department of the Distrito Federal (hereafter referred to as Mexico City) announced a new program, the Barrios Magicos. The program involved the designation of eleven neighborhoods as "magical," both to direct capital investment and promote tourism beyond the Centro Historico. While a relatively small program, Barrios Magicos nevertheless evinces a subtle shift in planning priorities. In the decades following World War II, the ethos of urban planning in Mexico City revolved around Modernization, civic improvement, and a story of progress through massive public works. However, in the 1970s and 1980s, such grand planning schemes dissipated in the wake of a series of regional and global crises, including petroleum shocks, social unrest, and the devastating earthquake of 1985. With the rise of multiparty politics, the era of great public works gave way to experiments in public-private partnerships and a devolution of planning responsibility from the Distrito Federal to its constituent delegaciónes (boroughs). Out of this broad context came many experimental efforts to attract foreign investment, increase tourism, and manage urban complexity at the neighborhood scale. As part of these efforts, the Barrios Magicos program took shape within the division of tourism and public relations as a heritage promotion scheme. While a marginal initiative, the program nevertheless reveals the canny efforts by city officials to trade on a particular kind of heritage imaginary, one woven from elements internal to Mexico (the art and literature of magical realism, devotional practices such as Day of the Dead) yet reflected through an external conception of 'Mexicanness' as rustic, quaint, and underdeveloped. In this way, planners attempt to convert the heritage of Mexican surrealism, religious devotion, and bottom-up creative dynamism into cultural capital, and to deploy that capital to leverage public and private investment in neighborhoods. This paper examines the Barrio Magicos program as an instance of "worlding" through heritage, with particular attention to the local, national, and global scales on which urban cultural production is negotiated. I argue that the vague and nebulous aims of the program are perfectly attuned to the enchantments of global finance and real estate development as these scour local environments around the world for investment opportunities.

„Time for change is today! ": Reforming Islam and narratives of temporality. Cotemporary Germany as a case study.

Iskandar Ahmed Abdalla
FU Berlin

A recurrent trope in the discourses of religious reform since the 19th century, is the idea of setting Muslims back on the "correct" track of time, of allowing them to caught up with modernity as a normative marker of progress, invoking a liberation from the "medieval" constraints of Islamic traditions that yielded them to a stagnant status of underdevelopment hindering them from thinking and living as modern subjects. The advocates of a "liberal European Islam" in today's Germany embrace a similar idea from a position that assumes not only a disjuncture between Muslims modes of thinking and being and when they live, but also where they live, highlighting Europe as an entity that embodies modernity in both temporal and spatial terms. A liberal approach suggests to resolve the dissonance resulted by an Islam which is regarded here, contemporaneous and non-contemporaneous at once. For doing that it induces Muslims to think of their history as "merely collective memories," to cast their religious belonging as "a private issue" and thus to reconcile their identity "with the principles of western culture." This will eventually lead them to be "citizens of their countries in the first place." This line of argumentation emphasizes how far the modalities by which time discursively operates as a trope for debating Islam in Germany, are inextricably interwoven with the considerations of where Islam should be located and how it should function within the framework of the secular-liberal state. Building on Reinhart Kosellek's examination to the conceptual shifts modernity brought up in understanding history2 and Timothy Mitchell's critical engagement with the experience of modernity as an arrangement, in the centre of which the west is located in relation to discordant geographies of the non-west, for its layout historical time serves as a qualifying measure, this paper attempts to understand the suggested reform venture in relation to a homogenizing agency of a dominant template of time that aim to flatten religious experiences of history and locate it on the coordinate of its axis. The modern, the enlightened is rehearsed here as tantamount to Europe/the West, and in reference to the history of the later, all other histories "must establish their significance and receive their meaning."

Histories of underdevelopment, configurations of prevention

Dana Dolghin
University of Amsterdam
dana.dolghin@gmail.com

In this paper I investigate the concept of underdevelopment in the early 1990s in Eastern Europe and consider it as constitutive, rather than contrary, to the triumphal turn to liberal democracy. In the early days of 1990, Romanian sociologist Pavel Campean was expressing a preoccupation echoed by many others at the time: how do we move further faster? The Romania Libera daily ran for several years after 1989 the "Market of Ideas" column, open to anyone with a substantial opinion of what was to be done economically and socially. There was an even an impetus in development through demography when the same sociologist was lamenting the lack of enough European and transnational contacts after the end of Nicolae Ceausescu's regime. Campeanu was not alone. American sociologist's Jeoffrey Goldfarb's article, who wraps up his argument about Europe with "The political projects of the Enlightenment preceded Marxism and socialism, and remain vibrant after a new end of ideologies. Now that the cold war is over, a more sustained struggle for democracy should start". From journalists to academics to the social democrats in power, the imaginary emerging was mobilizing a fast "modernization" away from the underdevelopment that communism meant. The decade of the 1990s came to be synonymous with a culturalist idea of transition, where the liberal subject articulated against the past, necessarily seeing the future as emancipatory. In this paper, I look at the bind between under-development and anti-communism as a mobilizing narrative for a new type of "politics of hope" (Judith Shklar).

"Time Passes, But the Future Doesn't Come". The expectations and frustrations of Modernity and the imaginaries of Heritage in Egypt

Nermin Elsherif
PhD Candidate, UvA, Amsterdam School for Heritage, Memory and Material Culture

Bereft of the present and future to look up to, the Egyptian middle class has turned to the past and particularly to what it perceives as "the images" of its lost modernity both as refuge and as a powerful resource for online cultural capital. The circulation of vintage photographs of what is considered the modern heritage of Egypt is often intertwined with a particular narrative of time. Facebook users involved in this reproduction of past online express a sentiment of a deep frustration, constantly waiting for a future that never comes. The underlying sentiment among their narratives is that the nation was once on the telos of development and modernity that was interrupted and further aborted by several events. While the users usually offer different interpretations of these interruptions; the 1952 free officers movement, the 1967 defeat, the 1973-77 open door policies, or further the neoliberalization of the state in 1990s, there is a consensus that the nation is currently left in a state of "underdevelopment". In this paper, I investigate how this narrative of "under-development" is co-produced over social media – as a domain of sharing and creating opinions. I focus on the pages and groups concerned with the urban modern heritage of Egypt, drawing a relation between how heritage is defined by the state and how it is imagined by these engaged users. Thus, I argue for a further nuanced understanding of heritage in relation to the imaginaries – expectations and frustrations – of the modern state, and the stigma of underdevelopment.

The Imagined Realities of "The Underdeveloped": Uses of Underdevelopment Discourse among Indigenous People in Panama

Boana Visser
University of Kent

The rising industry of indigenous tourism imagines indigenous peoples in Latin America, and worldwide, as the living images of a distant past; as keepers of tradition and culture; indeed, as subjects of heritage. Yet, the various States in which these peoples' lived realities play out often view these same subjects as uncivilized and underdeveloped savages, hindering national economic progress. In Panama, a political approach of neoliberal multiculturalism has shaped images of indigenous peoples as essentialized subjects of cultural heritage in the promotion of tourism on the one hand and as backwards and poor 'natives' in need of economic development and progress on the other hand. The Ngöbe, the largest indigenous group in Panama, are considered the poorest and most marginalized section of the population. The State has promoted formal education and greater participation in the national economy as the solutions for this problem. The Ngöbe themselves have also embraced education, state that they have become 'civilized', rejecting some of their past traditions, and frequently invoke discourses of poverty, needs, and (under) development. At the same time, Ngöbe individuals may lament the 'loss' of their traditions and often reject the idea that they are poor, dependent and marginalized.

Based on ethnographic fieldwork in Bocas del Toro, a popular tourist destination in Panama, this paper addresses the ways in which Ngöbe individuals employ a discourse of underdevelopment, the extent to which they may have internalized this discourse, and the impact this may have on their individual and collective identities as indigenous people. I suggest that the seemingly paradoxical ways in which the Ngöbe embrace discourses of underdevelopment collectively and reject the same notions individually reflect the political and moral ambiguities inherent in the discourse, approaches and conceptualization of (under)development. While development supposedly aims to alleviate poverty and inequality, historically, it has (re)created unequal power structures and the subject position of 'underdeveloped'. I furthermore propose that the strategic use of such discourse in some instances and its denial in other instances are powerful tools that indigenous peoples may use in their attempts to live well, within the limits posed by their socio-political environment.